GLASS CEILING STUDY

This Update is to solicit your review and comments on the attached report from the Glass Ceiling Study Task Force.

The Task Force has been meeting weekly since 14 May and submitted their report to the Executive Director on 3 August. The Deputy Director for Central Intelligence and the Executive Committee (EXCOM) have been briefed by the Task Force members. The EXCOM will be meeting soon to take action on the report.

In keeping with the DCI's commitment to increase openness at the CIA, the report is being distributed to all employees for review and comment. The strategies in the report are intended to set standards and suggest ways to ensure a more equitable work environment for all employees. The report will be used as a guide for the development of Directorate- or component-specific action plans. These plans will be developed within the spirit of the action items contained in the report.

Each employee is encouraged to review the report and submit any comments in writing to the Office of Equal Employment Opportunity. Comments must be received by 24 August 1992.
Implementation of The Glass Ceiling Study:

Intelligence Excellence Through Diversity

August 1992
Implementation of the Glass Ceiling Study: Intelligence Excellence Through Diversity

3 August 1992
The Glass Ceiling Study clearly indicates that the Agency faces a major challenge in creating an equitable work environment that is viewed as such by every individual. Positive initiatives to meet this challenge have begun in many parts of the Agency, but there is more to be done. Creating an equitable work environment will not be achieved quickly or without costs; however, not achieving this goal will cost us even more. It is imperative for Agency officials to sustain the effort if there is to be any hope for its success. The actions outlined in this report are not solutions; they are only the first steps in a long, iterative process.

The creation of an equitable work environment must be viewed, particularly by senior Agency management, as inseparable from this organization's mission. There is no trade-off between this objective and the business of intelligence. Creating an environment that will allow the Agency to take full advantage of the diversity in its work force is essential to the Agency's ability to achieve its intelligence objectives. It is only through a diverse and highly motivated work force that this Agency's mission can be successfully achieved.

Ensuring an equitable work environment is also good business for the Agency, particularly in an era of diminishing human and financial resources. We must make maximum use of the talents and skills of all present and future employees. A work environment that provides a full opportunity for all employees is essential if the Agency expects to attract, develop, and retain employees of the highest caliber.
To formulate a plan for making the Agency's work environment more equitable, the Implementation Group began by addressing the areas identified in the Glass Ceiling Study as needing special attention—the assignments process, feedback and communications, multicultural/gender issues, and work/family policies. Specific actions the Group believes might be appropriate for each of these areas are contained in the appendixes to this report.

As the Group continued its discussion of glass ceiling issues, it became evident that certain actions, common in all areas, must be taken first to begin the process of eliminating the barriers to an equitable work environment. The actions outlined below are designed to achieve two overarching goals in that regard; first, senior Agency management's commitment to the elimination of the glass ceiling and a demonstration of that commitment, and second, Agency-wide commitment to the program. The Group believes that the achievement of these two goals is essential for the Agency to begin the process of building a more equitable work environment.

I. Commitment of Senior Agency Management

- The DCI must reemphasize with words and actions the necessity of directly connecting diversity to the Agency's mission by clearly stating that the Agency can best achieve its mission through recognizing and fully using the talents of a diverse work force.

- The DCI must hold a yearly off-site with the EXCOM members that is dedicated to evaluating the progress made to overcome the barriers identified in the Glass Ceiling Study. Each Directorate must prepare an annual report on diversity issues prior to the off-site; and each Deputy Director should personally brief that report explaining the progress that has been made in his or her Directorate during the previous year. He or
she must also present a strategic plan for the following year. To provide an overall Agency perspective, the D/OEEO and representatives from the Agency's network groups must also attend and present their assessment. Following the off-site, the OEEO will prepare an Agency report and circulate it to all employees.

- Senior Agency managers must communicate their commitment to diversity objectives to their employees through "town meetings" dedicated to a discussion of these issues. Managers should use these meetings as a forum to present specific information on progress that has been made and to outline future plans to continue progress in meeting diversity objectives.

- The role and resources of the EEO must be expanded to enable effective monitoring of glass ceiling actions.

- Senior management must strongly support an increased emphasis on—and ensure its own, subordinate managers, and ultimately full employee participation in—a training program designed to increase multicultural and gender awareness, to better address work and family issues, and to improve management and cross-cultural communication skills. Many diversity issues that develop are intensified because of a lack of training.

- Senior management must demonstrate a commitment to effective management of a diverse work force through assignments and awards for those employees with an established record of achievement.

- The Agency's various minority and women's network groups are a very important and useful resource on glass ceiling issues. The DCI and senior management must meet regularly with these groups to obtain
feedback on the progress that the individual Directorates and components are making in their efforts to build a more equitable work environment. Management must also hold periodic discussions with the groups to find ways to resolve the various issues of concern that are unique to each of them.

- The Executive Director will form a cross-directorate working group to define the role and responsibilities and assess the pros and cons of creating a position equivalent to a deputy director for human resources. This Implementing Group believes that a strong case can be made for such a position. Having such a position with the incumbent serving as a permanent member of EXCOM would signify senior management's recognition that all EXCOM decisions—especially in an era of diminishing resources—have human resource implications. Many of the corporate executive boards of private-sector firms that have had the most success in creating and sustaining an equitable work environment have a vice president for human resources as a permanent board member.

- Decisions taken by the EXCOM based on the actions in this report must be disseminated to all Agency employees.

- Because the disabled and hearing-impaired employees were not included in the Glass Ceiling Study, the EXDIR must immediately establish a task force to address their situation. Membership must include representatives designated by the disabled and deaf and hard-of-hearing networks.
II. Accountability

Each Deputy Director and the EXDIR representing the E Career Service must review the detailed action plans in the appendixes to this report and provide a Directorate plan that addresses the specific items. The action plans establish a standard but may be adapted to fit the organizational structures in each Directorate. The EXDIR must be responsible for implementing any items requiring Agency-wide action. The plans and periodic progress reports must be provided to Directorate employees.

- An independent follow-on to the Glass Ceiling Study must be repeated in the fall of 1994 to determine the level of progress that has been made.
- Inspections by the Office of the Inspector General must include a review of glass ceiling issues in component inspections and others as applicable.
- OMS should expand the employee opinion survey to capture employee views on the Agency's work environment in the areas of multicultural and gender equity as well as work/family issues. The survey should be done yearly and timed so that the results are available for discussion at the DCI off-site.
- All employees must be given the opportunity to evaluate management and unit performance, including diversity issues.

The action plans described above are only the first steps toward creating an equitable work environment. Although the Implementation Group recognizes that every Agency employee has an obligation to work toward this objective, the proposed action plans emphasize the Group's belief that progress in this area will be achieved only if senior Agency managers visibly demonstrate their commitment by both words and deeds. The appendixes that follow outline
further plans for consideration by each Directorate in its effort to eliminate the glass ceiling.
APPENDICES
Appendix A

Assignments Process

The assignments process must be open and accessible so that all Agency employees have an equal opportunity to seek assignments commensurate with their career goals and skill levels. Management at all levels must be accountable for ensuring the integrity of the system, monitoring career development, and involving all employees. In particular, each Directorate must prepare a written plan—reviewed by the EXCOM and subsequently published—addressing the objectives below.

The specifics laid out under the Objectives are normative. The implementation plans will have to be tailored to the Directorate and components concerned. But the spirit and driving force behind the plans must lead to an assignments process that is consistent, fair, visible, and understandable—and one in which standards and actions are a matter of record.

Objective I: Open the assignments process for developmental and managerial positions.

Each Directorate will publicize those assignments that are key and/or developmental in nature. This list will be reviewed on an annual basis, amended as necessary, and circulated to employees. Key assignments should include all management positions and identification of the types of professional experiences that are considered key. Such information must be provided in a timely manner.
Selection panels—including a female and a minority representative—will be established to consider applicants for such positions. Where appropriate and feasible, interview teams, including a minority and/or a female representative, should interview applicants for these positions and recommend and justify in writing the rank order of the applicants to the selection panel.

Procedures and guidelines for selection panels will be prepared and made available to employees.

For those positions for which a Deputy Director is the final decisionmaker, the selection panel will recommend and justify in writing the rank order of the applicants; such recommendations, as well as the recommendations of the interview teams, will be provided to the Deputy Director. If panel recommendations are not accepted by the final decisionmaker, the rationale for the selection will be provided to the selection panel.

Selection panels will address in writing what consideration was given to female and minority applicants.

For assignments at or above deputy component chief and for staff chief assignments, the Senior Personnel Review Board—chaired by the Executive Director and including a female and a minority representative—will nominate candidates, at least one of whom will be from outside the selecting Directorate, whenever appropriate. (The selection process should include a name check
with OEEO as it currently does with the IG and OP/SAS.) The Senior Personnel Review Board will then provide to the DCI its recommendation, a written justification of its rank order of the nominees, and a record of the consideration given to minority and female officers.

**Objective II: Empower employees to play a more active role in their career development planning and ensure systematic feedback from managers on career development.**

Each Directorate will establish a career development panel consisting of line management to examine and guide the career development of each Directorate employee, with special emphasis to ensure that women and minorities are treated fairly. (The DO has begun using such a system.)

- The career development panel will set up procedures for each employee to provide substantive input for his/her own five-year career development plan and goals.

- The career development panel will establish a timetable for monitoring progress and be accountable to each individual employee for the validity of the plan.

An annual report by the career development panel will be prepared for the Deputy Directors. The progress of minority and female officers must be covered in this report.
Objective III: Create a system to permit minorities and women to break out of stereotypical assignments.

Directorates will take steps to assist women and minorities to break out of stereotypical assignments. Rotational/exchange assignments within and across Directorates will be encouraged to broaden employees currently in specialist assignments.

- Each Directorate and the "E" Career Service will identify positions for rotational/exchange assignments.

- Exchanges will be arranged for high-performance officers from components with relatively large numbers of minorities in linguistic/cultural/technical specialties such as DO transcribers, OTE language instructors, DS&T/DI media analysts, and DA, DS&T, and DI engineers.

- Each Directorate will offer woman and minority leadership development training. (The DI and the DS&T offer such pilot courses.)

- "Shadowing" assignments similar to those at NSA will be offered to women and minority officers, especially in grades GS-13 through GS-15. All senior Directorate and component managers will be encouraged to consider taking on "shadows" as a way of providing valuable experiences to women and minorities and giving them increased visibility at senior levels throughout the Agency. These assignments can be of varying duration but will
be long enough to allow the "shadow" to experience all facets of a senior manager's responsibilities.

Objective IV: Involve women and minority network groups in the assignments process.

Managers will solicit input from the network groups on assignments; minority and female employees will use the network groups as informal conduits; and the network groups will actively serve as facilitators for both management and employees in the assignment process.

- Each Directorate will designate new or use existing points of contact to work with the network groups.
- Senior women and minority officers will be encouraged to assist in providing the names of interested women and minority employees to designated points of contact.

Objective V: Improve the effectiveness of the vacancy notice system.

The vacancy notice system is a mechanism to ensure that employees are aware of opportunities in the Agency. The system must be improved by the inclusion of more information on the notice and the assurance of a wider distribution among employees.

- Vacancy notices will state specific requirements for the position with weight given to desired and required criteria. Whether the assignment is key/developmental will be indicated.
- They will also include notations about whether alternative work arrangements such as job sharing could be accommodated.
The use of "already has a qualified candidate" or other comment that discourages qualified candidates from applying will be eliminated.

All employees will have easy access to vacancy notices, especially those for key/developmental assignments.

Objective VI: Establish a tracking system to monitor consideration of women and minorities for key positions.

A tracking system that measures the impact of improvements made in the assignments process is needed to assess effectiveness.

- Each Directorate will determine the number and percentage of women and minorities considered/chosen for the top 50 vacancies during the most recent fiscal year.

- In a similar manner, each component will determine the percentage of women and minority candidates considered/chosen for first-line managerial positions.

- These statistics will be reported at the annual DCI off-site.
Feedback and Communications

The Glass Ceiling Study, as well as various internal surveys, found that employees believe that performance feedback and communications are critical to career progression. Employees also believe that there is not enough performance feedback and that, when given, it is not specific.

Each Directorate must take steps to ensure that it uses the existing mechanisms for providing feedback. It must also implement the following objectives.

Objective I: Ensure that employees receive information about the promotion, assignments, and awards processes.

Promotion, assignments, and awards processes differ across the Agency. Employees often express confusion over the processes used in their own offices. It is imperative that these processes are understood by those they affect.

- Each Directorate will issue and periodically update an Employee Handbook. Components will provide detailed explanations of their promotion, assignments, and awards processes to include a description of the criteria used. Periodic briefings on the processes will be provided to employees.
- Components will review the promotion, assignments, and awards processes yearly to determine objectivity and effectiveness.
- Components will publish both the criteria for awards and the names of awards recipients.
Objective II: Ensure that mechanisms for providing performance and potential feedback exist and hold supervisors accountable for providing it.

In order for employees to advance their careers, they must have accurate information regarding their performance and potential as viewed by management. Managers, in turn, must know what is expected of them in the area of employee feedback and must have the appropriate communications skills.

- Each Directorate will distribute a Supervisor's Handbook that includes a section on the performance feedback process.
- Each Directorate will publish "Management Tenets" that communicate specific expectations for the performance of office, group, division, and branch-level managers. The tenets will be incorporated into key job elements in the Performance Appraisal Report. (The DI has recently published its management tenets.)
- An annual "performance standards" document, such as an AWP, must be prepared for employees during their trial period, and consideration should be given to implementing this on a wider scale.
- Feedback sessions with employees will be held at least semiannually, but quarterly sessions are encouraged. The dates and topics of these discussions will be documented in the PAR. Suggested areas for improvement will be explicitly covered in the sessions. In the case of poor performers or employees who are misassigned, a concrete action plan must be developed that lays
out the steps that will be attempted by the employee and management to rectify the situation.

- All career services will include effective diversity management as part of the evaluation of line managers.

- The Agency will implement a system to ensure that all employees recognize their right to know their career service's evaluation of their potential and that managers know they have an obligation to provide this information. Managers must provide information on substandard performance to an employee irrespective of that employee's desire to receive feedback.

- OTE will distribute basic feedback and communications tools, such as videos on how to give/receive feedback and the use of effective communications procedures, including critical listening skills.

- OTE will include eliciting/requesting feedback from managers in new employee orientation training.

Objective III: Ensure management training on providing positive and negative feedback and coaching a diverse work force.

The fear that giving negative feedback to a woman or minority might result in an EEO complaint creates a competitive disadvantage in career evaluations. Training is absolutely essential to correct this situation.

- Cross-cultural communications skills will be included in management training courses.

- The Agency will issue periodic information about the EEO and grievance processes.
Objective IV: Acknowledge and demonstrate management's commitment to an effective mentoring process.

Mentoring has proved to be a very worthwhile "informal" mechanism for employees to use to increase their effectiveness on the job and to advance their careers. Agency managers must recognize the importance of mentoring and encourage it in their organizations.

- Directorates will periodically publicize the importance, purpose, and value of mentoring experiences.
- Directorates will include mentoring in their "Management Tenets."
- Components will establish a program to offer mentoring to new employees.
- Components will sponsor mentoring programs for current employees with emphasis on women and minorities. Experienced minority and majority officers will be called upon. (The DI has established a pilot program.)
- Components will establish an annual mentoring award.
- Mentoring will be explicitly recognized in performance evaluations, if applicable.
Appendix C

Diversity Issues

The Glass Ceiling Study recommended that the Agency look carefully at its policies regarding diversity issues, including sexual and racial harassment, stereotyping, and training. This section includes actions to address these issues.

Objective I: Increase the emphasis on eliminating harassment in the workplace.

Written Agency policies and procedures on sexual harassment are sufficient. They clearly state that sexual harassment of any kind is unacceptable, specify procedures for reporting incidents, and place adjudication responsibility with management. However, there is no written Agency policy on racial harassment, and both employees and management lack the skills to deal with harassment issues.

- The Agency must issue a formal policy addressing racial harassment, and the DCI's personal message on this subject must be communicated to all employees.
- Each Directorate must develop a mandatory training segment to educate all employees on what is and what is not harassment and the appropriate actions to take when it occurs.
- Each Directorate must develop a mandatory training segment to educate all managers on their responsibilities in responding to harassment in the workplace.

Objective II: Place the responsibility for eliminating stereotyping as a factor in assignments and awards with the heads of career panels.
Stereotyping exists throughout the Agency, and it has an adverse effect on both the work environment and the career development process. Stereotypes that arise in the course of deliberations about assignments and awards often result in an uneven playing field for women and minorities. The addition of women and minority representatives on career panels is a positive step; however, there is little if any training or guidance given to those selected about their roles and responsibilities.

- The heads of career panels must take the necessary steps to ensure that any stereotypical biases held by members of the panels do not adversely affect decisions and report these steps annually to their respective Deputy Directors.

- The heads of career panels must develop precepts/guidelines for all panel members on their roles and responsibilities, including the requirement that sensitivity to stereotyping/bias is the responsibility of all panel members.

- Career panels or other appropriate bodies must take a more proactive approach to placing employees—men, women, and minorities—in positions that will break the stereotypical mold.

Objective III: Ensure that a comprehensive multicultural and gender training program exists across the Agency.

The Agency has made important strides in addressing diversity issues through training. However, the content, duration, and impact of diversity training programs vary considerably by Directorate, as does the level of resource investment.
Each Deputy Director and the EXDIR for the E career service must ensure that a basic program exists to accommodate harassment and diversity training for all employees, both at Headquarters and in the field.

Each Deputy Director must ensure that all employees—once they have completed the basic training—maintain a heightened understanding of the importance of multicultural issues/gender differences, stereotyping, different styles of communications, and leadership—through additional and regular training, workshops, and seminar experiences.

OTE must serve as a clearinghouse for information about internal and contractor-run courses that can be used by the Directorates in developing their respective programs.

Directorate focal points for diversity issues must share information about their training programs.

The status of Directorate diversity training programs must be discussed at the annual DCI off-site.
Appendix D

Work and Family Policies

The Glass Ceiling Study identified a lack of clear work and family policies as a barrier to advancement, particularly for women. The study noted that, "There is no consistent policy or even value judgment across the Agency in regard to work/family issues. This frustrates employees who need clearer guidelines to function more effectively and leaves managers confused as to how to handle difficult situations related to work/family issues."

A number of family-related programs and policies, which provide managers and employees a great deal of flexibility to balance work and family responsibilities, already exist in the Federal Government and in the Agency. The problem is, in part, that necessary information on these programs is not available in one place, and that experience with flexible programs is not widely known throughout the Agency.

Given the trends in the private sector and the rest of government, a "family-friendly" organization will be more successful in attracting and keeping the best employees.

Objective I: Publish an unclassified handbook on current policies and programs related to work/family issues.

A handbook called Balancing Career and Family has been drafted by OP with publication scheduled for summer 1992 and distribution set for all employees. It will be available for family members at Family Day in September 1992. (We were able to review the galleys and recommend changes and additions.) To demonstrate management's commitment to support
employees as they balance work and family concerns, the following steps must be taken.

- The Deputy Directors (and Heads of Independent Offices) must add a covering note before distribution within their respective areas to reinforce senior management commitment and support the use of these programs in all Agency cultures. (The handbook begins with a supportive note from the DCI.)

- The handbook must be updated annually (geared to Family Day for redistribution).

- Nonattributable information packages on work/family programs must be developed and updated for distribution through the satellite office and in the field.

Objective II: Enhance the proposed Work/Family Center in the atrium of the NHB.

OP is currently working on the establishment of a Work/Family Center. This Center will serve as the Agency-wide focal point for implementation of work/family policies and as an information resource for all employees. It will also be a tangible demonstration of the Agency's commitment to such programs. The Work/Family Center will have at least the following responsibilities.

- Develop and conduct an annual employee survey of work/family policy needs in order to focus the Agency's limited resources on those that are the most pressing.

- Develop central data bases on:

  - Tandem couples and assignment opportunities for them.
- Flexible work arrangements used now in each Directorate.
- Skills of contract spouses to be matched with employment requirements for staff positions when such spouses return from overseas assignments.

- Maintain contact with OPM, other Intelligence Community agencies, and organizations in the private sector to:
  - Maximize successful policies and programs (for example, [example 1] has nearly 400 employees in job-sharing arrangements whereas [example 2] has fewer than 10).
  - Broaden the scope of the Emergency Leave Bank and other benefits programs (for example, include coverage in the ELB for time spent with terminally ill family members irrespective of the employees' responsibility for providing home care).
  - Tap external sources of employment for spouses.

- Develop a mandatory training segment on work/family programs and policies for all managers.
- Develop and implement uniform policies on work/family issues such as:
  - Dependents' access to Agency buildings to allow for some flexibility so that employees may work in call-in situations.
  - The treatment of part-time employment and the use of annual/sick leave and/or LWOP following childbirth with respect to minimum time-in-grade guidelines for promotion purposes.
Ensure, to the extent possible, that sufficient resources are allocated for part-time assignments throughout the Agency.

Ensure that the Agency's key developmental and core courses are occasionally offered in the Washington area with preference given to those employees whose family responsibilities prevent them from taking such courses outside the Washington area.

Maintain close links to the Family Advisory Board.

Objective III: Provide high-level support to the Work/Family Center, recognizing the resource constraints the Agency faces at this time as well as the importance of these issues to all Agency components.

The primary costs for establishing and maintaining a Work/Family Center will involve personnel services, initial construction, and ADP support. The resource commitment will be quite small in comparison to the important services the Center will bring to all employees and their families.

- Use Family Day or another appropriate forum to announce the establishment of the Center.

- Head it by an SIS-level position.

- Draw its core staff from the Office of Personnel with appropriate resources from other offices such as OMS, OTE, OEEO, and OGC.

- Include a representative from each Directorate (home-based in that Directorate and with supervisory experience) to serve on rotation with a slot supported by the home Directorate in order to:
- Add broad Agency experience and representation to the Center.

- Aid communications between the Center and the Directorates.

- Serve as a visible commitment by each Directorate to the Center.

• Ensure that the Center has heterogeneous staffing.

• Establish a Work/Family Executive Council of line managers and human resource specialists to provide advice and guidance to the Work/Family Center, serve as a soundingboard for new ideas, and aid in the implementation of new programs and policies.