Page Denied
MEMORANDUM FOR: Assistant to the President for National Security Affairs
Chairman, President's Foreign Intelligence Advisory Board

SUBJECT: Intelligence Community Experiment in Competitive Analysis:
A Team Comments on the B Team Reports

1. As spelled out in Leo Cherne's letter to George Bush of 8 June 1976,
the ground rules for the experiment in competitive analysis undertaken in
connection with the recently completed NIE 11-3/8-76 called for comments by
the A Teams responsible for preparing portions of the draft Estimate on the
reports submitted by the three B Teams, which have already been forwarded
to you.

2. It did not prove feasible in practice to carry out the final part
of the experiment exactly as outlined in the ground rules. In the normal
course of preparing the NIE, the A Teams were superseded by the NFIB and its
representatives, and then by the DCI as he exercised his overall responsibility
for the final estimate. In addition, the PFIAB requested that the A and B
Teams report their findings and comments to it somewhat earlier in the process
than had been anticipated. To meet the needs and schedules of the estimative
process and the PFIAB, the comments of the several teams were presented orally
to both the PFIAB and the NFIB, after which the B Teams were disbanded and the
A Teams resumed their other duties.

3. While I believe the methods actually employed fulfilled the intention
of the experiment and its ground rules, I forward herewith comments on the
B Team reports which were prepared by my staff to provide a written record.

4. Specific topics covered in these comments are, in order:

a. Soviet Low Altitude Air Defense Capabilities
SUBJECT: Intelligence Community Experiment in Competitive Analysis:
A Team Comments on the B Team Reports

b. Soviet ICBM Accuracy
c. Soviet Strategic Objectives
d. Critique of Intelligence Estimates and Methodology by B Team on Soviet Objectives

[Signature]
E. H. Knoche
Acting Director

Attachment
SUBJECT: Intelligence Community Experiment in Competitive Analysis: A Team Comments on the B Team Reports

Distribution:
Cy 1 - Ass't to Pres for NSA
2 - Chm, PFIAB
3 - ADCI
4 - ER
5 - D/DCI/IC
6 - D/DCI/NI
7 - DDI
8 - NIO/USSR
9 - NIO/SP
10 - D/OPEI/ICS
11 - D/OSR
12 - OSR/SEC
13 - Ch, SALT Support Staff
14 - NIO/RI
15 - CPS

NIO/SP: HStoertz (23Feb77)