

F-2001-01650

(b)(3)
(b)(6)

APPROVED FOR RELEASE
DATE: 02-22-2011

July 11, 2001

Information and Privacy Coordinator
Central Intelligence Agency
Washington, D.C. 20505

Dear Coordinator:

Under the Freedom of Information Act, 5 U.S.C. subsection 552, I am requesting certain items of information or records on FATHER JAMES (GUADALUPE) CARNEY and DAVID ARTURO BAEZ CRUZ, two U.S. citizens who disappeared in Honduras in 1983 after entering that country from Nicaragua with a guerrilla column. I would like to offer you a few paragraphs of information about these two men which may be helpful in your task; then I will specify the information about them, but not limited to them, which I want.

Father James (Guadalupe) Carney, a veteran of World War II, had worked in Honduras for 18 years. His defense of human rights and his support of the farmers' organizing efforts resulted in his deportation in 1979. In 1983 he returned to Honduras as a chaplain to an armed revolutionary column (PRTC-H: Revolutionary Party of Central American Workers-Honduras); the group was captured by the Honduran army, and Father Carney disappeared. The Honduran military suggested that he had starved to death in the mountains. Five years later, a former sergeant of the Honduran army, Florencio Caballero, told The New York Times (June 5, 1988) that he personally had interrogated Carney and that the priest had been tortured, executed and perhaps thrown from a helicopter.

The CIA has stated that it cannot rule out the possibility that Father Carney was captured and killed by the Honduran military.

David Arturo Baez Cruz, a Nicaraguan who had become a U.S. citizen and then had served in the Green Berets (U.S. Army Special Forces) mainly in Panama before returning to his native Nicaragua, also entered Honduras as an advisor to the revolutionary group -- the Revolutionary Party of Central American Workers. Baez was named in a 1983 telegram from the U.S. Southern Command and identified as a member of the group who was killed in action in Honduras. His remains, like those of Father Carney, have never been found.

MY REQUEST

All of the following requests refer to the CIA Inspector General's Report of Investigation: Selected Issues Relating to CIA Activities in Honduras in the 1980s (96-0125-IG), August 27, 1997.

The US government presented this report to the Honduran government in 1998. I currently have possession of this report, but some of the information in the report has been redacted (i.e., blacked out). Pursuant to the Freedom of Information Act, I request that the CIA release to me certain names and other information redacted from the report, which I have described in detail below.

-
1. Notes on the interviews conducted by the CIA Office of Personnel Security (OPS) on behalf of the Honduras Working group between July 1995 and August 1996; and the responses which 34 CIA officers provided on the questionnaires prepared and distributed by the Honduras Working Group in the same period. (p. 2., Para # 2)
 2. Name of "the Chief of the Honduran Special Forces Battalion" who "had killed insurgent leader Reyes Mata and other insurgents—possibly including American priest Father James Carney...." (p. 4, para. # 4)
 3. Name of person whom Headquarters reportedly "tasked to determine what happened to Carney." (p. 4, para. 4)
 4. Memorandum sent to CIA Executive Director Nora Slatkin by the head of the Honduras Working Group at her request in 1996 or 1997 which identified specific individuals whose actions should be reviewed for accountability purposes. (p. 5, para. 5)
 5. Headquarters Cable dated January 14, 1985, which includes information regarding the Agency's interrogation policy [pp. 18-19, para 47].
 6. CIA record dated January 31, 1996 in which Section 20 is entitled "Human Rights Violations and other Proscribed Acts" which provides guidance regarding the CIA's interrogation policy. [p. 19, para 48]
 7. Name of person who made the "report concerning Reyes Mata and Father Carney"? (p. 22, para 54) Name of person who "was responsible for killing Reyes Mata and his

insurgents—possibly including Father Carney”?

8. Documents/interviews/witnesses which “indicate that Reyes Mata was captured in the course of the Olancho Operation and executed by ____ while in the custody of the Honduran military.” (p. 33, para 86)

9. Name of person who executed Reyes Mata. (p. 33, para 86)

10. March 24, 1988 report prepared by the CIA's Office of General Counsel summarizing its review of the circumstances surrounding the 1983 disappearance of Carney and the Agency's handling of this family's 1984 Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) request. P. 37, para 97.

11. October 3, 1983 CIA Headquarters Memorandum containing the Acting Chief of DO/LA's draft response to HPSCI Chairman Edward P. Boland's inquiry about Father James F. Carney. (p. 44, para. 120)

12. Training and activities of the Honduran Airmobile Squadron [alternatively called Air Mobelie Unit] in 1983, particularly its deployment to Nueva Palestina (p. 46, para. 126 and p. 80, para 218)

13. Name of person or entity which “had received information indicating that PRTCH guerrillas who had been captured by the Honduran Armed Forces in Olancho Department had been summarily executed by Honduran Army officers after being debriefed”? (Pp 46-47, para 127)

14. Names of the others “among those executed”? (P. 47, para 127)

15. Name of the “Nicaraguan advisor” – was it David Arturo Baez Cruz, an American citizen (born in Nicaragua) who had served in the U.S. Green Berets? (P. 47, para 127)

16. Name of person who “stated that the justification within the Honduran military for the executions....” (P. 47, para 128)

17. Name of person who “provided additional information...” Please release information blacked out in this paragraph. (P. 48, para 130)

18. Name of person who “reportedly believed that Reyes Mata was held for a couple of days before being executed.... (P. 49, para 134). In same paragraph, name of person who “stated that the diary had been found intact.” Name of person who “did not know the contents of the missing pages....” Please release information blacked out in pages 49-52.

19. November 29, 1983 Intelligence Report that reported that Alvarez had initiated a formal investigation of the alleged theft of approximately \$25,000 confiscated during the Olancho Operation (p. 53, para 144).
20. Please release information blacked out in pages 54-56.
21. March 2, 1984 CIA Headquarters OLL Memorandum of Record which describes a meeting between HPSCI Staff member Steve Berry and LA Division Chief Duane Clarridge (p. 56, para 151)
22. March 2, 1984 CIA Headquarters Memorandum from CATF's Special Assistant to the Chief, DO/LA with information on the Olancho Operation and Carney. (p. 57, para 152)
23. Name of person who "advised that Carney was never held specifically at El Aguacate or anywhere else"? Name of person who "did not comment on the individuals..."? (p. 58, para 158).
24. March 20, 1985 CIA record regarding the congressional inquiries received by CATF about human rights abuses by the GOH and the FDN, and the resulting review of headquarters' files and press items. (p. 59, para 160)
25. June 12, 1995 Headquarters Draft Response prepared by DO/LA in response to a June 8, 1995 letter from Rep. Robert G. Torricelli to the National Security Advisor. (page 60, para 164) And, please release full text of this letter by Rep. Torricelli.
26. Transcription or notes of the May 23, 1995 briefing of HPSCI members on Guatemalan issues by CIA officers. (page 60, para 164)
27. June 28, 1995 letter to Torricelli from CIA's Director of Congressional Affairs, responding to the questions posed by the Congressman at a May 23, 1995 briefing and in a June 8, 1995 letter. (page 61, paragraph 166)
28. Name of person who "advised that...." (P. 61, para 167) In same paragraph, name of person who "reportedly provided details of the 1983 Olancho Operation..." In same paragraph, name of person who "also indicated that Father Carney was not with the guerrilla group...."
29. Name of person who "stated that..." (P. 61, para 168). In same paragraph, name of person who "was accompanied by other officers." In same paragraph, name of person referred to as "possibly including ____." In same paragraph, name of person who

“reportedly had shot Reyes Mata in the forehead with a .45 calibre pistol.”

30. Name of person who “had also claimed that he did not know of Carney’s fate...” (P. 64, para 176). In same paragraph, name of person who “commented that it was probable that the analyst had been given....”
31. July 14, 1995 Intelligence Report. Name of person or entity which gave “an additional account of Carney’s death”? (P. 64, para 178) Name of person “who had reportedly told...”? Name of person or entity which is the object of “told”?
32. On P. 65, name of person who “had told _____ that she had received this information...”? Name of person or entity which is the object of “told”? Name of person who “had also reportedly indicated that Reyes Mata had been captured and killed...”? Names of persons who “were persistent critics of the Honduran military...”?
33. July 20, 1995 Intelligence Report on a 1984 ethics complaint related to \$15,000 taken from the bodies of insurgents. (page 66, paragraph 180) In same paragraph, name of person who was “accused of removing approximately \$15,000 from the bodies”? Name of person who “believed that all documents related to the encounter ... had probably been destroyed”?
34. Name of person who “stated that his knowledge of the event was based on the ethics complaint...”? (P. 67, para 183) In same paragraph, name of person who “indicated that _____ information corroborated...”? Name of person whose information “corroborated and added to that...”? To that OF WHOM?
35. August 15, 1995 Intelligence Report combining information on the deaths of Carney and Reyes Mata with INSCOM/AOG information from November 1983. (page 67, paragraph 184)
36. November 1983 INSCOM/AOG information on the deaths of Carney and Reyes Mata (page 67, paragraph 184) In same paragraph, name of person by whom Reyes Mata was executed.
37. September 14, 1995 Congressional Notification by CIA officials regarding CIA reporting relating to the death of Carney. (P. 68, para 186) Please release the September 14, 1995 Office of Congressional Affairs (OCA) background paper. Please release the blacked-out words after “one report” and after “a second report.”
38. October 11, 1995 Congressional Notification by CIA regarding the execution of Reyes Mata. (page 69, paragraph 187) In same paragraph, name of person involved “in the execution of Reyes Mata.” The “1983 AOG information that had been provided by an AOG source...”

39. October 1983 CIA intelligence report which included information on the execution of Reyes Mata. (page 69, paragraph 188) Please release all names blacked out in this paragraph.
40. May 23, 1996 CIA record about a pistol and a piece of clothing of Carney's reportedly recovered by captured insurgents, and a Honduran helicopter search of the area. (page 69, paragraph 189) In same paragraph, name of person who "had provided information regarding the disappearance of Carney"? Name of person who had "been told that the SFC never saw Carney"? Name of person who "had indicated that Honduran helicopters were unable to locate Carney..."?
41. May 31, 1996 Intelligence Report clarifying that it is unknown if Carney was alive or dead when left behind by his comrades. (page 70, paragraph 191)
42. Name of person who "related that Honduran Special Forces had captured an aide to Carney who was in possession of the priest's stole and chalice"? (p. 71, para 195). Name of person who "said that the Special Forces backtracked...."? Name of person who "estimated that Carney had been dead for several days"?
43. February 14, 1997 Intelligence Report. Please release this report. Name of person who was the "former Honduran soldier who had told a close confidant..."? (p. 74, para 203) Name of person by whom was the patrol led? Name of person who "ordered the body to be buried at the site"?
44. Name of person who "commented that the Lieutenant probably killed Carney's aide as he was not needed after finding the cache"? (p. 77, para 211).
45. Name of person whom Alvarez advised that enough prisoners had been taken? (p. 77, para 212) In same paragraph, name of person who, along with "other officers, marched the guerrillas into the jungle and executed them"? In same paragraph, name of person who "also had executed another captured guerrilla"?
46. Name of person who "estimated that Honduran Special Forces executed between 30 and 40 of the captured guerrillas"? Name of person who said he witnessed the executions? (p. 77, para 213) What comes before "killing a Nicaraguan advisor"? Please reveal all names in this paragraph.
47. What comes before and after "we have to make them disappear"? (p. 80, para 220) Name of person by whom was ___ "given overall responsibility for ensuring that the executions were performed by each officer"?
48. What comes before "that he had captured and executed Reyes Mata"? (p. 81, para 221) Please release all information in this paragraph.

49. Who ordered whom "to assemble a patrol..."? (p. 81, para 223) Name of person who "collected approximately 15 men..."? What comes after "the individual led the patrols to the hammock"? Name of person who "believes that the leader of the primary patrol..."?
50. Name of person who "did not return Carney's body to Nueva Palestina because it was badly decomposed"? (p.82, para 225).
51. Name of person who "advised CINC Alvarez..."? (p. 82, para 226) Name of person who "had stolen money from the guerrillas"? Name of person who "had received some of the proceeds"? Name of person who was "reassigned because of this theft"? Name of person who "was the field commander for the operation"?
52. Name of person who "said that prisoners captured during the Olancho Operation..."? (p. 83, para 229) Name of person who "confirmed the earlier report and added..."?
53. What comes before and after "on the Olancho Operation were hampered"? (p. 84, para 229) Please release all information on p. 84.
54. Name of person who "had indicated that Father Carney was left to die in a hammock..."? (p. 91, para 252)
55. Name of person who "recalls visiting _____ and sorting through..."? (p. 94, para 260) Visiting what? Name of person who "says that some of these individuals..."?
56. Name of person who "recalls one photograph, possibly black and white..."? (p. 94, para 261) Name of person who "does not recall whether this item was on the hammock..."? What comes before "believed this individual to have been Carney"?
57. Name of person who "recalls that the Hondurans were not showing..."? (p. 94, para 262) Name of person who "believes that this photograph was provided..."?
58. Name of person who "has no specific recollection of reporting or recording..."? (p. 94, para 263)
59. Name of person who "maintains that neither..."? (p. 95, para 263) What comes after "or other events"?
60. Name of person who "was not able to identify photographs of Carney..."? (p. 95, para 264) Please release all information in this and subsequent paragraphs.
61. Name of person who "was assisted in this operation..."? (p. 96, para 266)
62. Name of person who "recalls that the Honduran Armed Forces set up..."? (p. 96, para

267)

63. One of whose "Honduran assistants"? (p. 96, para 268) Name of person who "says he never saw these prisoners"?
64. Name of person who "advises that a group of U.S. newspaper reporters..."? (p. 96, para 269) Name of person who "believes that the inquiry related to him..."? He returned to what or where? Name of person who "does not recall any additional references..."?
65. Name of persons who "say that they were not aware of prisoners..."? (p. 96, para 270) Name of person who "indicates that the only support..."? (p. 97, para 270)
66. Name of person who "recalls a discussion" with whom? (p. 97, para 272) Name of person who "recalls that he had previously learned..."? According to whom, who "indicated that he had not participated..."? Name of person who "had been involved"? Name of person who "had come upon Carney while on a patrol..."? Name of person who "is not certain..."? Name of person who "told him that Carney was dead or left to die..."?
67. Name of person who "was provided with seized documents for his review..."? (p. 101, para 290) What comes after "was accompanied..."?
68. Name of person who "analyzed the diary of Reyes Mata..." (p. 103, para 293)
69. Name of person who "recalls that efforts were made by CIA..."? (p. 105, para 297). By whom was "relevant information provided"?
70. Name of person who "notes that there was significant interest"? (p. 105, para 298). What comes before "representative" and after "being assigned as"? Name of person who "had no recollection of matters..."?
71. Name of person who "was the individual primarily responsible..."? (p. 105, para 299). Name of person who "took great care in drafting..."?
72. Name of person who "initiated Headquarters traces and queried" whom? (p. 105, para 300).
73. Name of person who "provided an ___ officer with information..."? (p. 109, para 311). What comes before "officer"? Name of person who is indicated as having "shot insurgent leader Reyes Mata..."?
74. Name of person who "provided ___ with additional information..."? (p. 110, para

- 312). What comes after "Olancho Operation"? According to whom "this information provided"? Name of person who "had personally killed Reyes Mata"? Name of person who "indicated that only a young guerrilla..."? According to whom "the guerrilla was subsequently killed"? Name of person who "indicated" who was under investigation...?"
75. Name of person who was named as "having killed Reyes Mata..."? (p. 112, para 319)
Name of person who "confiscated and split with the CINC"?
76. The "basic information conveyed in the draft report... could not be refuted," according to whom? (p. 112, para 320)
77. Name of person who "said he had obtained the information..." (p. 112, para 321).
Name of person who "would not elaborate on the specific rumor..."? What comes before "that CINC Alvarez..."?
78. Name of person who "stated only that a young guerrilla..."? (p. 114, para 327) Name of person who "also said that" who "split money with..."?
79. Name of person who "stated that ___ had said that the priest..." (p. 195, upper half).
Name of person who "had said that the priest..."
80. Name of person who "says that ___ did not say..." (p. 195, upper half). Name of person who "did not say that he personally had found the priest..."
81. Name of person who said that "___, a former member of the Honduran Special Forces..." (p. 195, middle). Name of person who is "a former member of the Honduran Special Forces..."
82. Name of person/entity/document which "indicates that ___ said that ___ claimed that" Name of person who "said that ___ claimed...." Name of person who "claimed that the Honduran troops..." (p. 195, lower half).
83. Name of person who "states that ___ claimed to have placed the skull..." Name of person who "claimed to have placed the skull..." (p. 195, lower half) Please release the remaining blacked-out items on pp. 195-196.

WHY YOU SHOULD RELEASE THIS MATERIAL NOW

The incidents in question here – the disappearance of Father Carney and Mr. Baez Cruz – go all the way back to 1983. Some of the key individuals who MAY be mentioned in this Report, such as Gen. Gustavo Alvarez Martinez (head of the Honduran armed forces until 1984) and Donald Winters of the CIA, have died.

Moreover, the U.S. government has been very forthcoming in releasing large amounts of previously classified material concerning human-rights abuses in Chile. Also, the U.S. has insisted on the prosecution of Slobodan Milosevic and assisted in the arrest of former Peruvian spy chief Montesinos. Why is the U.S. government protecting alleged torturers and executioners in Honduras?

Finally, the Honduran government needs this information in order to see that justice is done. On October 29, 1999, two Honduran government officials -- Attorney General Roy Edmundo Medina and National Commissioner of Human Rights Dr. Leo Valladares Lanza -- wrote to Mr. Frank Almaguer, U.S. Ambassador in Honduras, expressing their interest "in obtaining additional information from the U.S. government concerning the identity of those responsible for the extrajudicial execution of Dr. Jose Maria Reyes Mata in 1983 and his burial site." (I believe this letter arrived at the State Department.)

The Honduran officials referred to the CIA Inspector General's Report, noting that "it contains numerous references to the execution of Reyes Mata, but in all instances the name or names of those responsible are blacked out."

The officials also referred to a November 4, 1998 article in the Washington Post, noting the statement by a U.S. official that the U.S. would provide "amplifying information on the incident through government-to-government human rights channels." The Honduran officials wrote: "We are eager to receive such information."

It should be presumed, but I will state it here, that if you cannot release all the items I have specified, please release those you can.

If you deny all or any part of this request, please cite each specific exemption you think justifies your refusal to release the information and notify me of appeal procedures available under the law.

FEES

If there are any fees for searching for, reviewing, or copying the records, and if it would require more than one month to make your decision on my request for a complete fee waiver (below), then please supply the records without informing me of the cost IF THE FEES DO NOT EXCEED \$200., which I agree to pay.

Nevertheless, I hereby request a complete FEE WAIVER because the disclosure of this information is in the public interest and not in any commercial interest on my part. This subject clearly concerns the operations or activities of the US Government.

The disclosure is informative and would contribute significantly to public understanding. The information requested will shed light on the activities and operations of the CIA in Honduras during the period in question. I plan to widely disseminate the information I have requested through editorials, speeches, press releases, and possibly in a book. I have the ability to analyze and disseminate this information. As a Catholic priest (Jesuit), I frequently give lectures at universities and churches in the U.S., and I am a free-lance writer.

If you have any questions about handling this request, you may contact me at my postal address or at phone numbers or email address above.

Sincerely,

ph Edward Mulligan

PS I would be glad to send this letter/request to you by email, if you would find it useful to have it in your computer.